

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD JANUARY 17, 2024**

Meeting was called to order at 8:00 p.m. by Council President Brandon McCullough. Present: Carrie Budzinski, Scott Morgan, Laura Toy, Jim Jolly, Vice President Martha Ptashnik, Rob Donovic, and President Brandon McCullough. Absent:

Elected and appointed officials present: Paul Bernier, City Attorney; and Todd Zilincik, City Engineer.

Councilmember Budzinski led the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance.

There was no Audience Communication.

President McCullough announced that Item #4 has been removed and will be on the February 12, 2024 Study meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

1. REQUEST TO WAIVE THE CITY'S NOISE ORDINANCE: Robert Rais, Knights of Columbus, re: to allow a car show with a DJ at Saint Colette's Catholic Church, 17600 Newburgh Road on Saturday, June 1, 2024, from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.

Robert Rais, Petitioner, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Toy verified that this event has been held seven years in a row.

Councilmember Jolly is a member of the St. Colette's Parish and of the Knights of Columbus and supports this event.

Councilmember Toy offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION:	APPROVING	CONSENT
------------	-----------	---------

2. REQUEST TO APPROVE BUDGET ADJUSTMENT: Office of the Mayor, re: to restore funding for the position of Government Affairs Director.

Mayor Brosnan presented the request to Council.

Vice President Ptashnik is in favor of this matter going to Committee of the Whole for further discussion.

Councilmember Morgan asked if this is an extensive search for someone with Legislative experience.

Mayor Brosnan indicated this is a position that leans toward more of a liaison between the Mayor's Office, Department Heads, and the Council Office. The focus will be to serve as a liaison and there will be a strategic component to the position. It will not have a primary focus on Legislative Affairs.

Councilmember Donovic offered an approving motion for the Committee of the Whole.

DIRECTION: REFER TO COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE CONSENT

3. REQUEST TO APPROVE SALARY AND FRINGE BENEFIT ADJUSTMENTS FOR THE CLASSIFICATION OF POLICE CHIEF AND DEPUTY POLICE CHIEF: Department of Civil Service, re: for the period of December 1, 2023, through November 30, 2026.

Jeannine Laible, Civil Service Director, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Donovic asked if our Chief and Deputy Chief salaries are comparable to other Communities.

Mrs. Laible said she hasn't looked specifically into the Chief and Deputy Chief positions but believes they are competitive.

Councilmember Toy would like to see retirement dollars for all positions in our community as well.

Mrs. Laible indicated the First Responders have a pension program and she has good faith that their plan is well funded.

Councilmember Jolly offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION: APPROVING CONSENT

4. REQUEST TO APPROVE ART IN THE PARK PROGRAM: Department of Parks and Recreation, re: to provide a low-cost framework for introducing art into our public spaces for 2024, from budgeted funds.

This item has been moved to the Study Meeting of February 12, 2024.

5. REQUEST TO APPROVE SOFTWARE LICENSING AND MAINTENANCE AGREEMENT WITH SOLE SOURCE PROVIDER: Public Works Division, re: with Azteca Systems, LLC, including Cityworks Online, for the DPW work management system, for the period of March 1, 2024, through February 28, 2025, from budgeted funds.

Doug Moore, Assistant Director of Public Works, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Morgan offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION: APPROVING CONSENT

6. AWARD OF BID: Public Works Division, re: for Ready-Mix Concrete for the City's 2024 calendar year requirements, from budgeted funds.

Doug Moore, Assistant Director of Public Works, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Toy offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

7. REQUEST TO PURCHASE ONE CEMENT SCARIFIER/GRINDER WITH SULKY DRIVER: Department of Public Works, re: to be used by the Roads Division, in an amount not to exceed \$44,797.96, from budgeted funds.

Doug Moore, Assistant Director of Public Works, presented the request to Council.

Vice President Ptashnik offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

8. AWARD OF CONTRACT: Department of Public Works, re: for the 2024-25 Municipal Park Mowing Program, which involves approximately 136 acres of parks, cemetery, and fire station property, from budgeted funds.

Doug Moore, Assistant Director of Public Works, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Donovic asked if the contractors are paid up front or each time they mow. He also asked if they handle the weeds at City Hall.

Mr. Moore indicated they are paid after they mow, and they only mow thirty-two parks, two fire stations and two cemeteries.

Councilmember Donovic asked if this will help with the quality control process to make sure they are doing a good job as they often hear concerns from residents about the height of the grass or clumps of grass left behind.

Vice President Ptashnik asked why the significant difference in price of about \$76,000 between the lowest and second lowest bidder. She also asked if there are any opportunities for negotiations with the second lowest bidder.

Mr. Moore indicated this happened last year when the lowest bidder apparently realized that they hadn't figured expenses correctly and decided they couldn't do the job, which put DPW in a bad position. Therefore, DPW is asking to have the second low bidder approved as well. He also indicated they cannot negotiate further without putting it out for bid again.

Councilmember Jolly said he thinks this is bad practice to allow two bidders because the second low bidder could contact the low bidder and ask them to back out and then give them work just to get the contract. He understands the logic behind the request but doesn't think it is in the best interest of the city to do this.

Mr. Moore offered to go with only the low bidder but indicated they would lose a lot of time if they backed out as it would have to go out for bid again. He indicated DPW had to do the mowing the last two years, and this takes away from their ability to handle other grounds work.

Councilmember Toy shared her concerns about approving the two bidders. She asked if DPW has staff to assist should the low bidder back out again to allow time to put it out for bid again.

Paul Bernier, City Attorney, indicated it would be a criminal offense for bidders to get together to do something like that and they could be prosecuted.

Councilmember Donovic said it frustrates him when bidders don't show up to the meetings to allow Council to discuss matters like this with them. He urged the vendors to show up at the next meeting. He also voiced concerns about being forced to hire the lowest bidder and feels it should be the lowest qualified bidder. He wants to avoid putting DPW into a difficult situation mid-season.

President McCullough explained the MITN process and verified we there are escape clauses for both bidders and there should also be Bid Bonds as well.

Councilmember Toy would like the bidder's names included on future agendas.

Councilmember Budzinski asked if the company has worked on a municipal level on projects of this size before.

Mr. Moore said few companies have so they do need to check the references.

Margaret Erle, 31545 Pembroke, asked if there was a large difference between the price quoted by the third lowest bidder.

Vice President Ptashnik indicated it was about \$18, 000 for a two-year contract for the next low bidder. She indicated there is a large difference between the quotes from the bidders.

Councilmember Donovic offered an approving motion for the Regular agenda. He also asked that both bidders attend the next meeting.

DIRECTION: APPROVING REGULAR

9. AWARD BID RECEIVED THROUGH THE TRI-COUNTY PUBLIC PURCHASING COOPERATIVE: Department of Public Works, re: for gasoline and diesel fuel for the period February 1, 2024, through January 31, 2026.

Doug Moore, Assistant Director of Public Works, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Toy offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION: APPROVING CONSENT

10. REQUEST TO ACCEPT STORM WATER FACILITIES MAINTENANCE AGREEMENT: Engineering Division, re: from Aligned Equity Group, LLC, in conjunction with the construction of a storm drain system that provides adequate drainage for the newly constructed ClearPath Assisted Living located at 33579 Eight Mile Road, in the Northeast 1/4 of Section 4.

Todd Zilincik, City Engineer, presented the request to Council.

Vice President Ptasknik offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION: APPROVING CONSENT

11. REQUEST TO ACCEPT STORM WATER FACILITIES MAINTENANCE AGREEMENT:
Engineering Division, re: from Dorin Lucacel and Rodica Moore, in conjunction with the construction of a storm drain system that provides adequate drainage for the newly constructed Moore Outdoor Storage located at 12330 Merriman Road, in the Southwest 1/4 of Section 26.

Todd Zilincik, City Engineer, presented the request to Council.

Councilmember Morgan offered an approving motion for the Consent agenda.

DIRECTION: APPROVING CONSENT

There was no Audience Communication at the end of the meeting.

For the Regular Meeting of February 12, 2024.

LORI L. MILLER, CITY CLERK