

OFFICE OF THE COUNCIL

COUNCIL MEMBERS

BRANDON McCULLOUGH, President
MARTHA PTASHNIK, Vice President
CARRIE BUDZINSKI
ROB GJONAJ DONOVIC
JIM JOLLY
SCOTT MORGAN
LAURA M. TOY



33000 CIVIC CENTER DRIVE
LIVONIA, MICHIGAN 48154-3097
(734) 466-2250
citycouncil@livonia.gov

COMMITTEE MEMEBERS:

ROB DONOVIC, Chair
JIM JOLLY, Vice Chair
CARRIE BUDZINSKI, Member

OFFICE OF THE COUNCIL

**MEETING PACKET FOR THE CAPITAL OUTLAY AND
INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE
OF OCTOBER 14, 2024
7:00 P.M.**

**The electronic agenda is compiled, produced and distributed
by the City Council Staff. (734) 466-2250**

The official documents are on file in the City Clerk's office.

**CAPITAL OUTLAY AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE
MONDAY, OCTOBER 14, 2024
Livonia City Hall. Council Chambers
33000 Civic Center Drive, Livonia, MI 48154
7:00 PM**

Members:

Rob Gjonaj Donovic, Chair
Jim Jolly, Vice Chair
Carrie Budzinski, Member

AGENDA ITEM(S)

1. [The subject matter of the planning, design and construction of the new Civic Center Campus. \(CR 330-24\)](#)

AUDIENCE COMMUNICATION

THE FOLLOWING HAVE BEEN NOTIFIED AND ARE REQUESTED TO ATTEND:

Maureen Miller Brosnan, Mayor
Carter Fisher, City Attorney
Dave Varga, Chief of Staff
Debbie Lichtenberg, Finance Director
Mark Taormina, Planning and Economic Development Director
Todd Zilincik, City Engineer
Dave Lear, Assistant City Engineer
Robb Drzewicki, Government Affairs Director
Plante Moran Realpoint Representatives

**THIS IS AN OPEN MEETING AND ALL
INTERESTED PARTIES ARE WELCOME TO ATTEND.**

**THIS MEETING WILL BE REPORTED AT
THE REGULAR MEETING OF NOVEMBER 6, 2024**

Minutes of this meeting will be available for public inspection in the City Clerk's Office not more than eight business days following the date of the meeting.

In accordance with Title II of the American with Disabilities Act as it pertains to access to Public Meetings, the City Clerk's Office of the City of Livonia, upon adequate notice, will make reasonable accommodations for persons with disabilities. Please call (734) 466-2236 or email clerk@livonia.gov if you need assistance. **Council agendas are available on the City's website – www.livonia.gov - under Government, City Council, Agendas.**

LORI L. MILLER, CITY CLERK



LETTER TO THE LIVONIA CITY COUNCIL

1.

Council Office
October 7, 2024

MEETING DATE

COI101424/R110624

PRESENTED BY

AGENDA ITEM

The subject matter of the planning, design and construction of the new Civic Center Campus. (CR 330-24)

BACKGROUND DETAILS

At the Regular Meeting of October 7, 2024:

RESOLVED, that upon the motion by Councilmember Rob Donovic, seconded by Council Vice President Martha Ptashnik, at the Regular Meeting held October 7, 2024, the Council does hereby refer the subject matter of the planning, design and construction of the new Civic Center campus to the Capital Outlay and Infrastructure Committee for its report and recommendation.

PREFERRED COUNCIL RECOMMENDATION/RESOLUTION (Please complete this field. Attachments are not to be used in lieu of the recommendation)

To discuss the subject matter as presented.

ATTACHMENTS

1. COI101424 LTC plan design construction of CC Campus
2. COI01424 Email - Award Recommendation Letters and Proposal Summaries
3. COI01424 LCC_City Hall_Contract Award Recommendation Letter_AE
4. COI01424 LCC_Contract Award Recommendation Letter_CE
5. COI01424 LCC_Contract Award Recommendation Letter_MP
6. COI01424 LCC_Survey_Contract Award Recommendation Letter
7. COI01424 LCC_Traffic Study_Contract Award Recommendation Letter

APPROVED BY

From: [Lichtenberg, Debra](#)
To: [Kasprowicz, Sara](#)
Cc: [Doug.Smith](#); [Andy.Fountain](#); [Paul Theriault](#); [Rick.Erickson](#); [Taormina, Mark](#); [Kandah, Gus](#); [Fisher, Carter](#); [Varga, Dave](#); [Ava Wisniewski](#)
Subject: RE: Award Recommendation Letters and Proposal Summaries
Date: Monday, October 14, 2024 12:12:06 PM
Attachments: [LCC Contract Award Recommendation Letter MP- Updated.pdf](#)
[LCC Contract Award Recommendation Letter CE-Updated.pdf](#)
[LCC City Hall AE Contract Award Recommendation Letter AE- Updated.pdf](#)
[LCC Survey Contract Award Recommendation Letter- Updated.pdf](#)
[LCC Traffic Study Contract Award Recommendation Letter- Updated.pdf](#)
[image001.png](#)

Sara,

CORRECT VERSIONS ATTACHED.

Attached please find the updated information relevant to the Capital Outlay and Infrastructure Committee Meeting to be held this evening. Please distribute and post the information accordingly.

Thank you!
Debbie

Debra Peck Lichtenberg, CPA
Finance Director
City of Livonia | Finance Department
(734) 466-2260
dlichtenberg@livonia.gov

Debra Peck Lichtenberg, CPA
Finance Director
City of Livonia | Finance Department
(734) 466-2260
dlichtenberg@livonia.gov

From: Ava Wisniewski <Ava.Wisniewski@plantemoran.com>
Subject: Award Recommendation Letters and Proposal Summaries

Good afternoon Livonia City Center team,

Plante Moran Realpoint is pleased to present the award recommendation letters for five services related to the new City Center Program.

1. Master Planning Services- HED
2. Civil Engineering Services- OHM

3. Architect Engineer Services of City Hall- HED
4. Traffic Study Services- Spalding DeDecker
5. Surveying Services- Spalding DeDecker

Please see the attached documents related to these recommendations. We will be there to present these at the Capital Outlay Committee meeting on Monday, October 14.

If there are any questions in the meantime please let us know. Thank you for your time over the last few weeks during this process.

Best,
Ava

Ava Wisniewski | Consultant

Plante Moran Realpoint, 3000 Town Center, Suite 100, Southfield, MI 48075

Direct Dial: 248.223.3998 | Mobile: 313.520.1364

[Plante Moran Realpoint](#) | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [LinkedIn](#) | [Subscribe](#)

Plante Moran Cresa and Plante Moran REIA are now Plante Moran Realpoint. [Learn more.](#)



Realize what it means to be built different.

This email, including any attachments, may contain confidential information and is intended solely for use by the individual to whom it is addressed. If you received this email in error, please notify the sender, do not disclose its contents to others, and delete it from your system. Any other use of this email and/or attachments is prohibited. This message is not meant to constitute an electronic signature or intent to contract electronically.

October 14, 2024

Ms. Maureen Miller Brosnan
Mayor
City of Livonia
3300 Civic Center Dr., Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia City Center – New City Hall Facility
Architectural/Engineering Services Contract Award Recommendation

Dear Ms. Miller Brosnan:

Please find in this letter an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) regarding our assignment to assist and advise the City of Livonia (COL) in selecting a professional architectural/engineering (A/E) firm for the new City Hall facility. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, COL administration, staff, and legal counsel (the Project Team) to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for the new City Hall facility.

The Architectural Engineering Services for City Hall Scope of Work is critical to designing the new facility. It is also paramount to begin this process quickly in order to meet the program's overall timeline and budget.

SELECTION PROCESS

In August and early September, the Project Team drafted a Scope of Work and request for proposals (RFP). This Scope of Work was also reviewed on several occasions in detail by the project team. PMR also reached out to roughly a dozen architectural/ engineering firms to garner interest in the RFP.

On September 9, 2024, the COL formally posted the RFP documents to MITN. The Project Team conducted a pre-proposal meeting on September 16, 2024, which twenty-five (25) firms participated in. After receiving proposals from twelve (12) firms on September 30, 2024, the Project Team evaluated them over the ensuing days.

The Project Team utilized a criteria-based selection (CBS) process to evaluate each A/E firm's Proposal. The CBS process used pre-established and weighted criteria to evaluate the proposals to objectively shortlist four (4) A/E firms for interviews. Selection criteria included relevant project

experience, proposed staff and team experience, past experience with the COL, available manpower, proposed fee, and firm approach to the project.

The Project Team conducted interviews with the shortlisted firms on October 8, 2024. The selection committee consisted of staff from PMR as well as Mayor Maureen Miller Brosnan, Dave Varga, Debra Lichtenberg, Mark Taormina, Jeannine Laible, and Brandon McCullough along with other City staff. Upon completion of the interviews and after subsequent discussion, the Project Team completed the CBS scoring process.

This recommendation is based on the fact that the firm achieved the highest CBS score for the proposed Project. This score was achieved due to their firm experience, team experience, the firm's approach to completing the project on schedule and within budget, and strong presentation/interview.

RECOMMENDATION

The Project Team recommends awarding the A/E services contract for the new City Hall Facility to HED (Harley Ellis Devereaux), pending final review of terms by legal counsel.

The total contract award recommendation is \$1,516,550 and is further defined as follows:

\$1,510,550	Fixed Lump-Sum Fee (approximately 6.43%)
\$ 6,000	Not-to-Exceed Reimbursables
\$1,516,550	Total Contract Award Recommendation

The A/E fee will be a fixed lump-sum amount based upon the scope, budget, and timeline established in the RFP. The reimbursables are a not-to-exceed amount and will be billed as incurred.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at (248) 227-4691 or rick.erickson@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the COL's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,

Rick Erickson, AIA
Plante Moran Realpoint

CC: Dave Varga, City of Livonia
Mark Taormina, City of Livonia
Debbie Lichtenberg, City of Livonia

Paul Theriault, Plante Moran Realpoint
Andy Fountain, Plante Moran Realpoint

ENCLOSURES: A/E Proposal/CBS Scoring Summary

October 14, 2024

Ms. Maureen Miller Brosnan
Mayor
City of Livonia
3300 Civic Center Dr., Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia City Center
Civil Engineering Services Contract Award Recommendation

Dear Ms. Miller Brosnan:

Please find in this letter an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) regarding our assignment to assist and advise the City of Livonia (COL) in selecting a firm to perform civil engineering (CE) services for the Livonia City Center Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, COL administration, staff, and legal counsel (the Project Team) to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for the City Center Program.

The Civil Engineering Services Scope of Work is critical to taking the Master Planner's vision from drawing board to reality. It is also paramount to begin this process quickly in order to meet the program's overall timeline and budget.

SELECTION PROCESS

In August and early September, the Project Team drafted a Scope of Work and request for proposals (RFP). This Scope of Work was also reviewed on several occasions in detail by the project team. PMR also reached out to roughly a dozen civil engineering firms to garner interest in the RFP.

On September 9, 2024, the COL formally posted the request for proposal (RFP) documents to MITN. The Project Team conducted a pre-proposal meeting on September 16, 2024, which fourteen (14) firms participated in. After receiving proposals from eight (8) firms on September 30, 2024, the Project Team evaluated them over the ensuing days.

The Project Team utilized a criteria-based selection (CBS) process to evaluate each CE firm's proposal. The CBS process used pre-established and weighted criteria to evaluate the proposals to objectively shortlist two (2) firms for interviews. Selection criteria included relevant project

experience, proposed staff and team experience, local presence and experience, available manpower, proposed fee, and firm approach to the project.

The Project Team conducted interviews with the shortlisted firms on October 9, 2024. The selection committee consisted of staff from PMR as well as Mayor Maureen Miller Brosnan, Dave Varga, Debra Lichtenberg, Mark Taormina, David Lear, Jeannine Laible, and Rob Donovic along with other City staff. completion of the interviews and after subsequent discussion, the Project Team completed the CBS scoring process.

This recommendation is based on the fact that the firm achieved the highest CBS score for the proposed Project. This score was achieved due to their firm experience, the team's experience working together, the firm's competitive proposed fee, and strong presentation/ interview.

RECOMMENDATION

The Project Team recommends awarding the CE services contract for the Livonia City Center Program to OHM (Orchard, Hiltz & McCliment, Inc.), pending final review of terms by legal counsel.

The total contract award recommendation is 6.5% of the Cost of Work. The CE fee will be converted to a fixed lump-sum amount based upon the scope, budget, and timeline established in an amendment to the contract at a later date. The reimbursables are a not-to-exceed amount and will be billed as incurred.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at (248) 603-5356 or doug.smith@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the COL's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,

Doug Smith
Plante Moran Realpoint

CC: Dave Varga, City of Livonia
Mark Taormina, City of Livonia
Debbie Lichtenberg, City of Livonia
Gus Kandah, City of Livonia
Paul Theriault, Plante Moran Realpoint
Andy Fountain, Plante Moran Realpoint

ENCLOSURES: CE Proposal/ CBS Scoring Summary

October 14, 2024

Ms. Maureen Miller Brosnan
Mayor
City of Livonia
3300 Civic Center Dr., Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia City Center
Master Planning Services Contract Award Recommendation

Dear Ms. Miller Brosnan:

Please find in this letter an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) regarding our assignment to assist and advise the City of Livonia (COL) in selecting a firm to perform master planning (MP) services for the Livonia City Center Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, COL administration, staff, and legal counsel (the Project Team) to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for the City Center Program.

The Master Planning Services Scope of Work is critical to bringing the City's vision for the City Center to life. It is also paramount to begin this process quickly in order to meet the program's overall timeline and budget.

SELECTION PROCESS

In August and early September, the Project Team drafted a Scope of Work and request for proposals (RFP). This Scope of Work was also reviewed on several occasions in detail by the project team. PMR also reached out to roughly a dozen master planning firms to garner interest in the RFP.

On September 9, 2024, the COL formally posted the request for proposal (RFP) documents to MITN. The Project Team conducted a pre-proposal meeting on September 16, 2024; which fourteen (14) firms participated in. After receiving proposals from eight (8) firms on September 30, 2024, the Project Team evaluated them over the ensuing days.

The Project Team utilized a criteria-based selection (CBS) process to evaluate each MP firm's proposal. The CBS process used pre-established and weighted criteria to evaluate the proposals to objectively shortlist four (4) firms for interviews. Selection criteria included relevant project

experience, proposed staff and team experience, local presence and experience, available manpower, proposed fee, and firm approach to the project.

The Project Team conducted interviews with the shortlisted firms on October 9, 2024. The selection committee consisted of staff from PMR as well as Mayor Maureen Miller Brosnan, Dave Varga, Debra Lichtenberg, Mark Taormina, David Lear, Jeannine Laible, and Rob Donovic along with other City staff. Upon completion of the interviews and after subsequent discussion, the Project Team completed the CBS scoring process.

This recommendation is based on the fact that the firm achieved the highest CBS score for the proposed Project. This score was achieved due to their firm experience, the team's experience working together, the firm's approach to completing the project on schedule and within budget, and strong presentation/ interview.

RECOMMENDATION

The Project Team recommends awarding the MP services contract for the Livonia City Center Program to HED (Harley Ellis Devereaux), pending final review of terms by legal counsel.

The total contract award recommendation is \$322,500.00 and is further defined as follows:

\$ 345,000.00	Fixed Lump-Sum Fee
- \$25,000	Credit to proposed fee (awarded both MP and AE for City Hall)
\$ 2,500.00	Not-to-Exceed Reimbursables
\$ 322,500.00	Total Contract Award Recommendation

The MP fee will be a fixed lump-sum amount based upon the scope, budget, and timeline established in the RFP. The reimbursables are a not-to-exceed amount and will be billed as incurred.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at (248) 603-5356 or doug.smith@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the COL's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,

Doug Smith
Plante Moran Realpoint

CC: Dave Varga, City of Livonia
Mark Taormina, City of Livonia

Debbie Lichtenberg, City of Livonia

Gus Kandah, City of Livonia

Paul Theriault, Plante Moran Realpoint

Andy Fountain, Plante Moran Realpoint

ENCLOSURES: MP Proposal/ CBS Scoring Summary

October 14, 2024

Ms. Maureen Miller Brosnan
Mayor, City of Livonia
3300 Civic Center Dr.
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia City Center Program
Contract Award Recommendation - Survey Services

Dear Ms. Miller Brosnan:

Please find in this letter an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) regarding our assignment to assist and advise the City of Livonia (COL) in selecting a professional surveying firm for the Livonia City Center Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, COL administration, staff, and legal counsel (the Project Team) to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for the Livonia City Center Program.

The Surveying Scope of Work is an important one in helping the Project Team understand the boundaries of the property, any easements or restrictions contained within, the location and condition of site utilities as well as the site topography.

SELECTION PROCESS

In early September, the Project Team drafted a Scope of Work and request for proposals (RFP). This Scope of Work was also reviewed in detail by David Lear and Todd Zilincik with the City, who had great insights into some of the historical conditions on site. PMR also reached out to all four (4) civil engineering firms, which are pre-qualified by the City, to garner interest in the RFP.

On September 18, 2024, the Project Team issued an RFP to the City of Livonia's four (4) pre-qualified civil engineering firms. After clarifying a few questions and issuing responses, three of the four firms submitted proposals on September 27, 2024, and the Project Team evaluated them over the ensuing days.

As the firms were pre-qualified, the Project Team did not utilize a criteria-based selection (CBS) process but did review the proposals for completeness of scope, fees/costs and acceptance of contract terms/conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

For this Project the selection team included staff from PMR as well as Dave Varga, Mark Taormina, David Lear, Todd Zilincik as well as other City staff. The Project Team recommends awarding the surveying services contract for the Livonia City Center Program to Spalding DeDecker, pending final review of terms by legal counsel.

The total contract award recommendation is \$67,750.00 and is further defined as follows:

\$ 67,750	Fixed Lump-Sum Fee
\$ 0	Not-to-Exceed Reimbursables
\$ 67,750	Total Contract Award Recommendation

This recommendation is due to the fact that Spalding DeDecker is pre-qualified by the City, had a very competitive fee, which was within budget, is one of the largest surveying firms in the state, can meet the proposed schedule and that they have previously surveyed several areas of the Civic Center property.

The surveying work is anticipated to be completed by the end of the calendar year, if not sooner.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at (248) 223-3380 or paul.theriault@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the COL's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,

Paul Theriault, PE LEED AP
Plante Moran Realpoint

CC: Dave Varga, City of Livonia
Mark Taormina, City of Livonia
Debbie Lichtenberg, City of Livonia
Gus Kandah, City of Livonia
Andy Fountain, Plante Moran Realpoint

ENCLOSURES: Proposal Summary

October 14, 2024

Ms. Maureen Miller Brosnan
Mayor, City of Livonia
3300 Civic Center Dr.
Livonia, MI 48154

RE: Livonia City Center Program
Contract Award Recommendation – Traffic Study Services

Dear Ms. Miller Brosnan:

Please find in this letter an update from Plante Moran Realpoint (PMR) regarding our assignment to assist and advise the City of Livonia (COL) in selecting a professional traffic study firm for the Livonia City Center Program. This update represents the mutual efforts of PMR, COL administration, staff, and legal counsel (the Project Team) to identify, evaluate, and recommend a firm for the Livonia City Center Program.

The Traffic Study Scope of Work is another important piece of information that is essential to the Project Team to understand any existing traffic flow issues in and around the Civic Center site and to assist in the Master Planning and Civil Engineering. This study will extend up to 1 mile in each direction from the corner of 5 Mile and Farmington Roads.

SELECTION PROCESS

In early September, the Project Team drafted a Scope of Work and request for proposals (RFP). This Scope of Work was also reviewed in detail by David Lear and Todd Zilincik with the City, who had good perspective on how far to extend the limits of the study. PMR also reached out to all four (4) civil engineering firms, which are pre-qualified by the City, to garner interest in the RFP.

On September 18, 2024, the Project Team issued an RFP to the City of Livonia's four (4) pre-qualified civil engineering firms. After clarifying a few questions and issuing responses, two of the four firms submitted proposals on September 27, 2024, and the Project Team evaluated them over the ensuing days.

As the firms were pre-qualified, the Project Team did not utilize a criteria-based selection (CBS) process but did review the proposals for completeness of scope, fees/costs and acceptance of contract terms/conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

For this Project the selection team included staff from PMR as well as Dave Varga, Mark Taormina, David Lear, Todd Zilincik as well as other City staff. The Project Team recommends awarding the traffic study services contract for the Livonia City Center Program to Spalding DeDecker, pending final review of terms by legal counsel.

The total contract award recommendation is \$17,700.00 and is further defined as follows:

\$ 17,700	Fixed Lump-Sum Fee
\$ 0	Not-to-Exceed Reimbursables
\$ 17,700	Total Contract Award Recommendation

This recommendation is due to the fact that Spalding DeDecker is pre-qualified by the City, had a very competitive fee, which was within budget, and can meet the proposed schedule.

The traffic study work is anticipated to be completed by the end of the calendar year, if not sooner.

If you have any questions regarding the above information, please feel free to contact me at (248) 223-3380 or paul.theriault@plantemoran.com. The Project Team is also available at the COL's convenience to answer any questions.

Sincerely,

Paul Theriault, PE LEED AP
Plante Moran Realpoint

CC: Dave Varga, City of Livonia
Mark Taormina, City of Livonia
Debbie Lichtenberg, City of Livonia
Gus Kandah, City of Livonia

Andy Fountain, Plante Moran Realpoint

ENCLOSURES: Proposal Summary