MINUTES OF THE TWO THOUSAND EIGHTH REGULAR MEETING JANUARY 27, 2025

On January 27, 2025, the above meeting was held at the City Hall, 33000 Civic Center Drive, Livonia, Michigan, and was called to order by the President of the Council at 7:00 p.m. Councilmember Scheel led the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance

Roll was called with the following result: Lynda Scheel, Scott Morgan, Laura Toy, Rob Donovic, Martha Ptashnik, Carrie Budzinski, and Brandon McCullough. Absent: None.

Elected and appointed officials present: Carter Fisher, City Attorney; Lori L. Miller, City Clerk; Mark Taormina, Planning and Economic Development Director; Sara Kasprowicz, Program Supervisor of Council Office; and Todd Zilincik, City Engineer.

On a motion by Councilmember Toy, supported by Vice President Ptashnik, and unanimously adopted, it was:

#16-25 RESOLVED, that the Minutes of the 2,008th Regular Meeting of the Council held January 15, 2025 are approved as presented.

During Audience Communication, Steve King, 33950 Coventry, expressed his concern for the large 96-gallon garbage totes recently delivered to residents and stated he felt the default size should have been the 64-gallon size. Mr. King also expressed his concern for the large amount of “For Lease” signs he has observed throughout local vacant businesses and felt this was a sign of blight and encouraged Council to revisit the City’s sign ordinance.

P.G., P.O. Box 155, Southfield, encouraged residents to be respectful of the Council proceedings and spoke about someone she felt was a great planner, Robert Gibbs. She indicated Mr. Gibbs always stated the “character” of a business does not mean it deserves the Council’s support. Ms. P.G. encouraged Council to listen to the views expressed by residents regarding what they do and do not want developed in their community.

Christopher Martin, Livonia resident, spoke about his recent visit to the 35th District Court in Plymouth and stated that court represents five communities and more than 170,000 residents and compared it to the 16th District Court in Livonia that only represents less than 80,000 residents. Mr. Martin stated he did not feel the 16th District Court would never break even or be profitable.

Mark Soboda, 19195 Centrailia, Redford, spoke about his concerns for Livonia not having sufficient bicycle and walking paths that provide safety and clearly marked lanes throughout the community. Mr. Sloba also expressed his concern for Livonia not having adequate public transit and encouraged Council to look at these concerns.

John Pastor, member of GH Pastor Foundation, provided information about his company hosting its annual Red Wing Alumni game v. Montreal Canadiens Alumni taking place Saturday, March 15th at the Big Boy Arena in Fraser. Mr. Pastor indicate proceeds from this great event go to the GH Pastor Foundation which is involved in various non-profit children organizations, including The Epilepsy Foundation. Mr. Pastor encouraged Council and residents to purchase their tickets using the QR code provided on the flier he left for Council.

Stephanie Richards, member of the Wayne County Sheriff's Office, introduced herself to Council and stated she is responsible for multiple communities and Livonia is one of the communities she represents. Ms. Richards stated she wanted to "touch base" to let Council to see if there is anything they need and encouraged them to reach out to her if they should need anything.

President McCullough announced there was New Data for Agenda Item #17.

President McCullough announced there would be an Infrastructure and Capital Outlay Meeting on Wednesday, February 5, 2025 at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers, Livonia City Hall, 33000 Civic Center Drive, Livonia.

Councilmember Budzinski announced the Livonia Women's Connection will meet next Thursday, February 6th from 6:00 – 8:00 p.m. at Kiloh + Company located at 37070 Amrhein and invited anyone interested to attend. Councilmember Budzinski reminded residents she hosts a monthly "Coffee Hour" at the Civic Center Library and shared some of her upcoming guests over the next few months. Councilmember Budzinski stated the only "Coffee Hour" not hosted at the Library will be the May meeting which will be held at Newburgh Village.

Councilmember Toy offered congratulations to President McCullough and Councilmember Donovic for their great efforts and participation in the Red Wings Alumni charity hockey game to raise funds for Breaking

Barriers and stated they raised more than $50,000 at this outstanding event. Councilmember Toy reminded residents January is "Human Trafficking Awareness Month" and stated it continues to be a very large-scale problem throughout the country and involves not only females and children, but also boys and men. She encouraged residents to educate themselves on the red flags to look out for and to report anything that seems strange. Councilmember Toy concluded by requesting a moment of silence to honor those who lost their lives in the Holocaust, as today was Holocaust Memorial Day.

Councilmember Donovic extended congratulations to President McCullough for the great success of the Red Wings Alumni charity hockey game and stated it was so much fun to raise $50,000 for such an outstanding non-profit organization in the Livonia community that does such great things for Livonia families. Councilmember Donovic commented on the trash carts mentioned during Audience Communication and stated the City went to great lengths to do its due diligence and research on the appropriate cart sizes before rolling out the default 96-gallon carts and acknowledged the resident concerns as expressed.

President McCullough provided a brief recap of the successful Red Wings Alumni charity hockey game held this past weekend and stated he was honored to be a part of such a great event to help the amazing, local non-profit organization of Breaking Barriers.

On a motion by Vice President Ptashnik, supported by

Councilmember Scheel, it was:

#17-25 RESOLVED, that having considered an application from Jessica McQuiston, Director of Communications, Penguicorp Inc., the Council does hereby take this means to indicate that Penguicorp Inc. is recognized as a non-profit organization operating in the community, and the action herein being taken for the purpose of affording Penguicorp Inc. the opportunity to qualify for a charitable gaming license or registration from the State of Michigan in accordance with provisions of State statute.

#18-25 RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from Council Vice President, Martha Ptashnik, dated January 7, 2025, wherein she has requested approval of the appointment of Brian Meagher, 18718 Golfview Street, Livonia, Michigan 48152 to the Zoning Board of Appeals, effective immediately in order to fill the unexpired term of Lynda Scheel, which expires July 12, 2026, and pursuant to Section 21.02 of the Livonia Zoning Ordinance, as amended, and Section 601 of Act 110 of the Public Acts of Michigan of 2006, as amended, the Council does hereby confirm and approve the appointment of Brian Meagher to the Zoning Board of Appeals with all the authority and duties as set forth in the said Zoning Ordinance and Act 110, and further provided that Brian Meagher takes the Oath of Office as required in Chapter X, Section 2 of the City Charter, to be administered by the Office of the City Clerk.

#19-25 RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the Office of the Mayor, dated January 6, 2025, and in accordance with the provisions of the Brownfield Redevelopment Financing Act, Act 381 of Public Acts of the State of Michigan of 1996, as amended, the Council does hereby approve of and concur in the appointment of Jumana Judeh, 19321 Fitzgerald, Livonia, MI 48154 to the Livonia Brownfield Redevelopment Authority, to complete the remainder of a three-year term, which will expire on November 24, 2027.

#20-25 RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the Fire Chief, dated January 6, 2025, which bears the signature of the Director of Finance and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby authorize the purchase of HURST E-Draulic Model E3 Jaws of Life extrication tool sets from MacQueen Emergency, 350 Austin Circle, Delafield, WI 53018, in an amount not to exceed $66,080.00, to enhance emergency response capabilities and to replace tools on Rescue-1 which are at eight years of service mark and need replacement due to changing technology and improvements in design and performance; FURTHER, an amount not to exceed $66,080.00 is hereby authorized to be expended from funds already budgeted for this purpose in Account No. 101-338-979-000; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize the action herein without competitive bidding in accordance with the provisions set forth in Section 3.04.140.E.3 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended, for the reason that MacQueen Emergency is a sole source distributor of HURST Jaws of Life extrication tools in the State of Michigan and no advantage would result from requiring competitive bidding.

#21-25 RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the City Assessor, dated January 3, 2025, which bears the signature of the Director of Finance and is approved for submission by the Mayor, and in accordance with Chapter VIII, Section 6 of the Charter of the City of Livonia, the Council does hereby determine to approve the following dates for the Board of Review to conduct public hearings in 2025, which public hearings are to be conducted in the Conference Room of the City Assessor on the first floor of the Livonia City Hall, 33000 Civic Center Drive, Livonia, Michigan 48154:

Tuesday	March 4, 2025	Organizational Meeting	9:00 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.

Monday	March 10, 2025	9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.	1:30 p.m. – 4:00 p.m.
Tuesday	March 11, 2025	9:00 a.m. - 12:00 p.m.	1:30 p.m. - 4:00 p.m.
Wednesday	March 12, 2025	5:00 p.m. - 9:00 p.m.	
Thursday	March 13, 2025	9:00 a.m. - 12:00 p.m.	1:30 p.m. - 4:00 p.m.
Friday	March 14, 2025	9:00 a.m. - 12:00 p.m.	

FURTHER, the Council does hereby determine that the daily rate of compensation to be paid to the members of the Board of Review shall be $120.00 for the Chairperson and $100.00 for other members.

Pursuant to Public Act No. 165, Public Acts of 1971, we hereby give notice that the following tentative ratios and multipliers will be used to determine the State Equalized Value (S.E.V.) for the year 2025:

CLASS	**RATIO**	**S.E.V. FACTOR (MULTIPLIER)**
Agricultural	50.00	1.0000
Commercial	50.00	1.0000
Industrial	50.00	1.0000
Residential	50.00	1.0000
Personal	50.00	1.0000

FURTHER, the Council does hereby approve the 2025 City of Livonia Guidelines for Poverty Exemption and Income Guidelines as set forth in the attachment to the aforesaid communication.

#22-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Human Resources Director, dated November 21, 2024, which bears the signatures of the Director of Finance and the City Attorney, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, which transmits Civil Service Commission resolution no. #24-223, adopted on November 20, 2024, wherein it is recommended to approve hourly rate adjustments for the High School Co-Op, College Co-Op and Seasonal Clerk classifications, due to the new minimum wage rates, the Council does hereby concur in and approve the recommendation of the Civil Service Commission to increase the hourly wage rate for the classifications of High School Co-Op, College Co-Op and Seasonal Clerk, in accordance with the following rate schedule, effective January 1, 2025, or upon Council's approval, whichever is later:

		Current	**01/01/2025**	**01/01/2026**
Highschool Co-Op	1st Year	$10.35		$12.50
	2nd Year	$10.60	$12.25	$12.75

College Co-Op	1st Year	$10.60	$12.25	$12.75
	2nd Year	$11.10		$13.25
Seasonal Clerk	1st Year	$10.60	$12.25	$12.75
	2nd Year	$11.10	$12.75	$13.25

#23-25 RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the Human Resources Director, dated December 20, 2024, which bears the signatures of the Finance Director and the City Attorney, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, which transmits Civil Service Commission resolution no. 24-231, adopted on December 18, 2024, wherein it is recommended to approve the proposed changes to job descriptions, classifications, and wages for part-time staff in the Department of Parks and Recreation, the Council does hereby concur in and approve the recommendation of the Civil Service Commission and adopting those changes as outlined in the aforementioned communication and attachments thereto, effective February 8, 2025.

#24-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Superintendent of Public Works, dated November 19, 2024, which bears the signatures of the Director and Assistant Director of Public Works, and the Director of Finance, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby accept the unit price bid of Ashton Contracting, 30443 Industrial Road, Livonia, MI 48150 for performing all work required in connection with the City's 2025 Season (April to December) Parks Tree and Stump Removal Program for an amount not to exceed $26,375.00, said cost and unit prices having been in fact the lowest bid received and meets all specifications; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure in an amount not to exceed $26,375.00, plus an additional $38,625.00 allocated for emergency tree work within the City Parks, for a total amount not to exceed $65,000.00 from funds budgeted in Account No. 226-528-882-060 for this purpose; FURTHER, in the event the low bidder is unable to fulfill the contract obligation, the Council does hereby accept the unit price bid of the second lowest bidder, G's Trees, 23596 Stacey Dr., Brownstown, MI 48183 to complete the work in an amount not to exceed $37,935.00, plus an additional $38,625.00 allocated for emergency tree work within the City Parks, for a total amount not to exceed $76,560.00; and the Mayor and City Clerk are hereby authorized to execute a contract, approved as to form and substance by the Department of Law, for and on behalf of the City of Livonia with the aforesaid bidder and to do all other things necessary or incidental to the full performance of this resolution.

#25-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Superintendent of Public Works, dated December 20, 2024, which bears the signatures of the Director and Assistant Director of Public Works, and the Director of Finance, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby accept the unit price bid of Boon Development, LLC d/b/a Sod Solutions, 14382 Sunbury, Livonia, MI 48154, for performing all work required in connection with the City's 2025 Right-of-Way Section Street Tree Trimming, emergency tree service and routine requests, with a one (1) year extension upon mutual consent, in an amount not to exceed $250,000.00, based upon the Public Service Division's estimate of units involved and subject to final payment based upon the actual units completed in accordance with the unit prices accepted herein, said estimated cost and unit prices having been in fact the lowest bid received and meets all specifications; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure in an amount not to exceed $250,000.00 from funds budgeted in Account No. 226-528-818-045 for this purpose; and the Mayor and City Clerk are hereby authorized to execute a contract, approved as to form and substance by the Department of Law, for and on behalf of the City of Livonia with the aforesaid bidder and to do all other things necessary or incidental to the full performance of this resolution.

#26-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Director of Public Works, dated January 9, 2025, submitted pursuant to Council Resolution 196-17, adopted on June 5, 2017, which bears the signature of the Director of Finance, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, in connection with the renewal of the contract between the City of Livonia and Azteca Systems LLC, for the DPW work management system, including Cityworks Online, the Council does hereby approve a renewal of software licensing and maintenance for the City of Livonia by Azteca Systems LLC, 11075 South State Street, Suite 24, Sandy, UT 84070 for a period of one (1) year commencing March 1, 2025 through February 28, 2026, in an amount not to exceed $100,881.14; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure in an amount not to exceed $50,440.57 from Account No. 592-559-851-020 (Water Fund) and $50,440.57 from Account No. 226-528-851-020 (Refuse Fund) for this purpose; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize the action herein without competitive bidding in accordance with the provisions set forth in Section 3.04.140.E.3 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended, for the reason that Azteca Systems LLC is a sole source supplier and no advantage would result from requiring competitive bidding.

#27-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Assistant Director of Public Works, dated January 9, 2025 which bears the signatures of the Director of Public Works and the Director of Finance and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby authorize the purchase of two (2) 15” drum style brush chippers (Model 15 XP), from Bandit Industries Inc., 6750 Millbrook Road, Remus, MI 49340, at a cost of $48,476.00 each, for a total amount not to exceed $96,952.00, to be utilized by the Roads Department and to replace two (2) current units whose repair cost and dependability exceeds their value; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure in an amount not to exceed $96,952.00 from funds budgeted in Account No. 226-528-987-000 for this purpose; FURTHER, the Council does hereby determine to authorize this purchase without competitive bidding inasmuch as the same is based upon the low MI Deal Co-Op purchasing program under Contract No. 190000000301, and no advantage to the City would result from competitive bidding, and such action is taken in accordance with the provisions set forth in Section 3.04.140.E.4 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize the disposal of the replaced equipment at public auction hosted by the Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) or commercial auction after receipt of the new equipment.

#28-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Assistant Director of Public Works, dated January 9, 2025, which bears the signatures of the Director of Public Works and the Director of Finance, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby authorize the purchase of one (1) Spartan pro self-contained leaf vacuum from MacQueen Equipment (formerly Bell Equipment), 78 Northpointe Dr., Lake Orion, MI 48359, in an amount not to exceed $142,101.00, to be utilized by the Roads Department (ID# 2518) and to replace an older unit whose repair costs and dependability exceed its value; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure in an amount not to exceed $142,101.00 from funds budgeted in Account No. 226-528-987-000 for this purpose; FURTHER, the Council does hereby determine to authorize this purchase without competitive bidding inasmuch as the same is based upon the low MI Deal contract bid process under Contract Agreement No. 071B7700091, and no advantage to the City would result from competitive bidding, and such action is taken in accordance with the provisions set forth in Section 3.04.140.E.4 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended.

#29-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Assistant Director of Public Works, dated January 9, 2025, which bears the signatures of the Director of Public Works and the Director of Finance, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby authorize the purchase of two (2) trailer mounted leaf vacuums (Veh #2516 and #2517) from MacQueen Equipment (formerly Bell Equipment), 78 Northpointe Dr., Lake Orion, MI 48359, at a cost of $82,374.00 each, for a total amount not to exceed $164,748.00, to be utilized by the Roads Department and to replace two (2) current units whose repair cost and dependability exceeds their value; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure in an amount not to exceed $164,748.00 from funds budgeted in Account No. 226-528-987-000 for this purpose; FURTHER, the Council does hereby determine to authorize this purchase without competitive bidding inasmuch as the same is based upon the low MI Deal contract bid process under Contract Agreement No. 071B7700091, and no advantage to the City would result from competitive bidding, and such action is taken in accordance with the provisions set forth in Section 3.04.140.E.4 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize the disposal of the replaced units at public auction hosted by the Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) or commercial auction after receipt of the new units.

#30-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Assistant Director of Public Works, dated January 9, 2025, which bears the signatures of the Director of Public Works, the Director of Finance and the City Attorney, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, to which is attached a First Amendment to the Animal Sheltering Agreement between the City of Livonia and The Michigan Humane Society, 30300 Telegraph Road, Suite 220, Bingham Farms, MI 48025, the Council does hereby authorize the Mayor and City Clerk, for and on behalf of the City of Livonia, to execute the attached first amendment to the Animal Sheltering Agreement, approved as to form and substance by the Department of Law, extending all terms and conditions of the current Animal Sheltering Agreement, dated January 1, 2024, for a period of three (3) months, commencing January 1, 2025 to March 31, 2025, at a new rate of $10,885.00 per month, for a total amount not to exceed $32,655.00 in monthly boarding/handling fees, with any additional charges/services accrued as defined in the original contract; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize a monthly expenditure in an amount not to exceed $10,885.00, for a period of three (3) months, from funds budgeted in Account No: 226-529-805-000 (Animal Collection) for this purpose; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize the said item without competitive bidding in accordance with Section 3.04.140.E.3 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended, for the reason competitive bidding is not available for this specialized service; and the Mayor and City Clerk are hereby authorized to do all other things necessary or incidental to the full performance of this resolution.

#31-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Assistant City Engineer, dated December 26, 2024, which bears the signatures of the Director of Public Works, the Director of Finance and the City Attorney, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, the Council does hereby accept the quote of Motor City Fence, 209 South Blvd. E., Rochester Hills, MI 48307 for performing all work required in connection with the DPW fencing replacement project, by extending their contract unit prices from 2023, with the exception of a 1.00% price increase, pursuant to Council Resolution Nos. 274-23 and 358-23, adopted on September 6, 2023 and November 13, 2023, respectively, in an amount not to exceed $95,519.00, based on the Engineering Division's estimate of units involved, and subject to a final payment based upon the actual units completed in accordance with the unit prices accepted herein; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize an expenditure from FY 2025 budgeted funds in an amount not to exceed $95,519.00 from Account No. 401-000-974-000 (Land Improvement) for this purpose; FURTHER, the City Engineer is hereby authorized to approve minor adjustments in the work as it becomes necessary but this authorization does not entitle the City Engineer to authorize any increase in the not to exceed amount or to contract with other parties; and the Mayor and City Clerk are hereby authorized, for and on behalf of the City of Livonia, to execute a contract, approved as to form and substance by the Department of Law, with Motor City Fence and to do all other things necessary or incidental to the full performance of this resolution; FURTHER, the Council does hereby authorize such action without competitive bidding for the reasons indicated in the aforesaid communication, and such action is taken in accordance with Section 3.04.140.E.4 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended.

#32-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the City Engineer, dated January 9, 2025, which bears the signature of the Director of Public Works, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, regarding repair of sidewalks in the City of Livonia pursuant to the 2024 Sidewalk Program, Contract 24-G, at the locations and in the amounts indicated in the attachment to the aforesaid communication (the "Attachment"), which work was done pursuant to Council Resolution 74-24, adopted on February 28, 2024, and in accordance with the provisions of Section 340 of Title 12, Chapter 4 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended, the City Treasurer is hereby directed to send a statement of charges to all property owners in the amounts listed in the Attachment in accordance with Section 150 of Title 3, Chapter 8 of the Livonia Code of Ordinances, as amended, and the Council does hereby establish the evening of June 16, 2025, at 7:00 p.m., at the Livonia City Hall, 33000 Civic Center Drive, Livonia, Michigan, as the time and place when the Council shall meet for the purpose of adopting a resolution placing a special assessment upon said property for such charges unless the same are paid prior to the date of such meeting; and the City Clerk and City Treasurer are hereby requested to do all things necessary or incidental to the full performance of this resolution.

A roll call vote was taken on the foregoing resolutions with the following result:

AYES: Scheel, Morgan, Toy, Donovic, Ptashnik, Budzinski, and McCullough.

NAYES: None.

A communication received from resident Erika Goff, 14398 Pere St., Livonia, dated January 24, 2025, in support of rezoning property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, was received and placed on file for the information of the Council. (Pet. 2024-08-01-04)

A communication received from John McKee, Training Officer, Livonia Fire 7 Rescue, dated January 21, 2025, re: property located at 37355 Eight Mile Road, was received and placed on file for the information of the Council. (Pet. 2024-08-01-04)

A communication received from residents Mark and Karen Williams, 19656 Ashley Court, dated January 22, 2025, re: rezoning property at

37355 Eight Mile Road, was received and placed on file for the information of the Council. (Pet. 2024-08-01-04)

A communication received from resident Bob Modes, 34026 Navin Drive, dated January 13, 2025, in support of rezoning property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, was received and placed on file for the information of the Council. (Pet. 2024-08-01-04)

A communication received from resident Laura Herrod, 37881 Bristol Avenue, dated January 13, 2025, in opposition to rezoning property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, was received and placed on file for the information of the Council. (Pet. 2024-08-01-04)

A communication received from the City Clerk, dated January 7, 2025, re: forwarding various materials received from resident Willard Lindley, 20218 Edgewood at the 256th Special Meeting of the City Council held January 6, 2025, re: proposed rezoning of property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, was received and placed on file for the information of the Council. (Pet 2024-08-01-04)

On a motion by Councilmember Toy, supported by Councilmember Budzinski, it was:

> RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the City Planning Commission, dated October 23, 2024, which transmits its resolution #10-55-2024, adopted on October 22, 2024, with regard to Petition 2024-08-01-04, submitted by Skilken Gold, requesting to rezone the property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, located on the southeast corner of Eight Mile Road and Newburgh Road in the Northwest ¼ of Section 5, from C-1 (Local Business District) to C-2 (General Business District), and the Council having conducted a public hearing with regard to this matter on Monday, December 9, 2024, the Council does hereby reject the recommendation of the Planning Commission and Petition 2024-08-01-04 is hereby denied for the following reasons:

1. The proposed zoning contradicts the Future Land Use Map, which designates the site as Parks and Community;

2. That the proposed change of zoning is inconsistent with adjacent zoning districts in the area;

3. That the proposed change of zoning is inconsistent with the established pattern of the development and would adversely alter the character of the area;

4. That the proposed change of zoning is not needed to develop the property;

5. The traffic generated by the proposed gas station and full-service restaurant with a drive-thru and the limited visibility created by the sloping road grades would increase the potential for traffic conflicts and delays;

6. Operating a business that includes a drive-thru, 24 hours per day, 7 days per week, is inconsistent with and contrary to the less intense surrounding land uses, including public parks, recreation, and single-family residential;

7. The proposed development would require substantial alterations to the site's topography, and given its proximity to sensitive features, including wetlands and a watercourse, would unnecessarily increase the potential for adverse environmental impacts; and

8. The proposed development, including underground storage tanks, a drive-thru, and other facilities of limited desirability for subsequent prospective users of the property, tends to limit the value and marketability of the property in the future.

On a motion by Councilmember Morgan, supported by Councilmember Scheel, offered the following substitute Motion:

RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the City Planning Commission, dated October 23, 2024, which transmits its resolution #10-55-2024, adopted on October 22, 2024, with regard to Petition 2024-08-01-04, submitted by Skilken Gold, requesting to rezone the property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, located on the southeast corner of Eight Mile Road and Newburgh Road in the

Northwest ¼ of Section 5, from C-1 (Local Business District) to C-2 (General Business District), and the Council having conducted a public hearing with regard to this matter on Monday, December 9, 2024, the Council does hereby refer this item to the Committee of the Whole for its report and recommendation.

On behalf of the Petitioner, Alex Sawicki, presented the proposed development to Council and was present to answer any questions of Council. (Petition 2024-08-01-04)

During Audience Communication, the following individuals spoke in opposition to the proposed rezoning of property located at 37335 Eight Mile Road, as submitted by Skilken Gold for Petition 2024-08-01-04:

Will Lindley, 20218 Edgewood, Livonia;
P.G., P.O. Box 155, Southfield;
Claudia Lindley, 20218 Edgewood, Livonia;
Marsha McLean, 20075 Edgewood, Livonia;
Sandra Moore, 20185 Ellen, Livonia;
Sharkey Haddad, representing Chaldean-American business owners;
James Crowley, 16106 Blue Skies, Livonia;
Ali Barrell, attorney and representative on behalf of the MINA Organization and Chamber of Commerce;
Joseph Rosner, 36261 Club Drive, Livonia;
Ralph Ourlian, 37182 Bretton Drive, Livonia;
William Clark, 11369 Cardwell St., Livonia;
Randy Gostomske, 36996 Five Mile Road, Livonia;
Bill Schmidt, DevonAire subdivision, Livonia;
Debbie Gostomske, 36996 Five Mile Road, Livonia;
Sharon Smith, 34458 Pembroke, Livonia;
Ralph McNabb, 36372 Fairway Drive, Livonia;
Nick Lomako, 20145 Edgewood, Livonia;
Ron Silys, 20101 Osmus, Livonia;
Kenneth Moore, Deer Creek subdivision, Livonia;
David Hall, 37300 W. Eight Mile Road, Farmington Hills;
Susan LaPeer, 37162 Fairfax, Livonia;
Julie Yashahara, 36241 Club Drive, Livonia;
Betsy Calhoun, 33023 Grennada, Livonia;
Holly Good, 20411 Wayne Road, Livonia;
Jim Koterba, 19710 Liverpool, Livonia;
Patty Riggio, 37204 Bretton, Livonia;
Ron Riggio, 37204 Bretton, Livonia;
Nancy Philpott, 20645 Golfridge Circle, Livonia;
Greg Ralko, Golfridge Villa subdivision, Livonia;
Christine Pagnucco, 37303 St. Martins, Livonia

The following individuals spoke in favor of the proposed rezoning of property located at 37335 Eight Mile Road, as submitted by Skilken Gold for Petition 2024-08-01-04:

Steve King, Coventry Gardens, Livonia;
Kevin Bank,93275 Daniel;
Marsha Abendroth, 30556 Puritan, Livonia;
Christina Rokanas, 18959 Deering St., Livonia;
Margaret Kamzizkis, Farmington Hills resident;
Johnny Leava, 4875 Stoneridge Drive, owner of subject property;
Diane Behrendt, NW Livonia resident;
Paul Derwick, Livonia resident;
John Pastor, 33461 Capri Court, Livonia

At 9:14 p.m., President McCullough passed the gavel to Vice President Ptashnik to speak on the matter. (Petition 2024-08-01-04)

Councilmember Budzinski spoke on the matter. (Petition 2024-08-01-04)

Councilmember Toy spoke on the matter. (Petition 2024-08-01-04)

Councilmember Donovic spoke on the matter. (Petition 2024-08-01-04)

Councilmember Morgan spoke on the matter. (Petition 2024-08-01-04)

Vice President Ptashnik called the vote on the substitute motion as offered by Councilmember Morgan, supported by Councilmember Scheel, as follows:

RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the City Planning Commission, dated October 23, 2024, which transmits its resolution #10-55-2024, adopted on October 22, 2024, with regard to Petition 2024-08-01-04, submitted by Skilken Gold, requesting to rezone the property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, located on the southeast corner of Eight Mile Road and Newburgh Road in the Northwest ¼ of Section 5, from C-1 (Local Business District) to C-2 (General Business District), and the Council having conducted a public hearing with regard to this matter on Monday, December 9, 2024, the Council does hereby refer this item to the Committee of the Whole for its report and recommendation.

with the following result:

AYES: Scheel, Morgan, and Donovic.

NAYS: Toy, McCullough, Budzinski and Ptashnik.

Vice President Ptashnik declared the motion failed for lack of support.

Following discussion by Council, Vice President Ptashnik called the vote on the original motion offered by Councilmember Toy, supported by Councilmember Budzinski, as follows:

#33-25 RESOLVED, that having considered a communication from the City Planning Commission, dated October 23, 2024, which transmits its resolution #10-55-2024, adopted on October 22, 2024, with regard to Petition 2024-08-01-04, submitted by Skilken Gold, requesting to rezone the property at 37355 Eight Mile Road, located on the southeast corner of Eight Mile Road and Newburgh Road in the Northwest ¼ of Section 5, from C-1 (Local Business District) to C-2 (General Business District), and the Council having conducted a public hearing with regard to this matter on Monday, December 9, 2024, the Council does hereby reject the recommendation of the Planning Commission and Petition 2024-08-01-04 is hereby denied for the following reasons:

1. The proposed zoning contradicts the Future Land Use Map, which designates the site as Parks and Community;

2. That the proposed change of zoning is inconsistent with adjacent zoning districts in the area;

3. That the proposed change of zoning is inconsistent with the established pattern of the development and would adversely alter the character of the area;

4. That the proposed change of zoning is not needed to develop the property;

5. The traffic generated by the proposed gas station and full-service restaurant with a drive-thru and the limited visibility created by the sloping road grades would increase the potential for traffic conflicts and delays;

6. Operating a business that includes a drive-thru, 24 hours per day, 7 days per week, is inconsistent with and contrary to the

less intense surrounding land uses, including public parks, recreation, and single-family residential;

7. The proposed development would require substantial alterations to the site's topography, and given its proximity to sensitive features, including wetlands and a watercourse, would unnecessarily increase the potential for adverse environmental impacts; and

8. The proposed development, including underground storage tanks, a drive-thru, and other facilities of limited desirability for subsequent prospective users of the property, tends to limit the value and marketability of the property in the future.

with the following result:

AYES: Toy, Donovic, McCullough, Budzinski and Ptashnik.

NAYS: Scheel and Morgan.

Vice President Ptashnik declared the resolution adopted.

President McCullough resumed the gavel at 9:32 p.m.

President McCullough adjourned the meeting for a ten-minute recess at 9:35 p.m.

President McCullough reconvened the meeting at 9:45 p.m.

On a motion by Councilmember Toy, supported by Councilmember Donovic, and unanimously adopted, it was:

#34-25 RESOLVED, that having considered the report and recommendation of the Human Resources Director, dated November 21, 2024, which bears the signatures of the Director of Finance and the City Attorney, and is approved for submission by the Mayor, which transmits Civil Service Commission resolution no. #24-214, adopted on November 20, 2024, wherein it is recommended to approve an hourly rate adjustment for the Student Substitute Librarian classification, effective upon Council's approval, the Council does hereby concur in and approve the recommendation of the Civil Service Commission to increase the hourly wage rate for the classification of Student Substitute Librarian, in accordance with the following rate schedule:

	Step	**Rate**
Student Substitute	Flat Rate	$20.00
Librarian	100 Hours	$22.00

Vice President Ptashnik gave First Reading to the following Ordinance:

An Ordinance vacating the use of portions of street, alley, and Public ground. (Petition 2024-10-03-02)

The foregoing Ordinance, when adopted, is filed in the Journal of Ordinances in the Office of the City Clerk and is the same as if word for word repeated herein.

There was no Audience Communication at the end of the meeting.

On a motion by Councilmember Toy, supported by Vice President Ptashnik, and unanimously adopted, this 2,009th Regular Meeting of the Council of the City of Livonia was adjourned at 9:50 p.m.

Lori L. Miller, City Clerk