

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

1) BLOCK PARTY: Margaret Alvarado, Julius Barber Shop, re: to be held Saturday, July 24, 2021, from 1:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. at the corner of Cavour Street and Five Mile Road to beginning of alley, with rain date of July 25, 2021.

The Petitioner not being present, Councilmember White stated the paperwork appears to be in order and I would be happy to offer an approving resolution for either Consent or Regular.

Vice President Bahr said I don't recall ever having a problem with one of these block parties, but I have one question about this one with its location being right off of Five Mile, I'm just concerned with safety with cars especially trying to turn in there in a place where the buildings are right up by the road and not realizing there's a block party there. I don't even know how this is handled. Does the City go out and put out the barriers or do we leave that up to the residents doing the block party?

President McIntyre replied it's generally left up to the residents to pick up the barriers from DPW, please correct me if I'm not correct on that, but I believe it's the responsibility of the residents.

Vice President Bahr said for that reason I think I'd prefer this to be on Regular, because I'd like an opportunity to talk to the Petitioner about that.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

REGULAR

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

2) REQUEST TO WAIVE THE CITY'S NOISE ORDINANCE: Judy Tenaglia, re: to host a gathering with live music in the back yard of their home located at 15367 Susanna Circle, on Sunday, July 25, 2021 from 2:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. with a rain date of Sunday, August 1, 2021.

Judy Tenaglia presented this request to Council, and thanked Council for putting in on the menu. It's basically just a backyard barbecue and we are having a small band. I wanted to make sure with Covid that I haven't done anything wrong.

Councilmember Toy offered an approving resolution for the Consent Agenda.

Councilmember Donovic asked the Petitioner what kind of food they're going to have on the menu and what is the cover charge to get in to see the band.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

3) AWARD OF BID: Livonia Fire & Rescue, re: for supplying uniforms and related uniform items for a period of three years, from budgeted funds.

Dave Heavener, Fire Chief, presented this request to Council. He said I'm here tonight to request an approving resolution to accept the bid for our uniform services. We go out for bid every three years to renew the bid for the services. Allie Brothers who as you all know is a longstanding local business and offers excellent on-site service for the Department was the lowest bid submitted that actually met all of the qualifications. So, this would be a three-year bid approval with also the option to extend two years at the end of that three years automatically if we so chose to do that.

Councilmember White offered an approving resolution for the Consent Agenda.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

4) REQUEST TO APPROVE AMENDMENT TO THE LEASE AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF LIVONIA AND THE LIVONIA PUBLIC SCHOOL DISTRICT: Department of Parks & Recreation, re: to allow the City to continue to utilize John Stymelski Veteran's Park and Mies Park until June 30, 2026, with the option to extend the lease for five (5) additional years with John Stymelski Veteran's Park and (10) additional years with Mies Park, on the same terms. (CR 139-00, CR 368-00 and 161-11).

Ted Davis, Superintendent of Parks and Recreation, presented this request to Council. He said we are asking Council to approve the lease extension with Livonia Public Schools for Mies and Stymelski Veteran's Park. We have been working on this with Livonia Public Schools for quite some time and we're happy to finally have agreements in hand and before City Council. Again, these are merely extensions of the existing leases, some which have expired several years ago but we are thankful again for Livonia Public Schools for working with us in bringing this before Council. I'd be happy to answer any questions Council may have on this.

Councilmember Toy offered an approving resolution for the Consent Agenda. Stymelski Park, we've done this many times before, nice little park, so I'd offer an approving on Consent if there's no objection.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

5) REQUEST TO APPROVE AMENDMENT TO THE SUBLEASE AGREEMENT BETWEEN CITY OF LIVONIA AND LIVONIA CIVIC ARENAS: Department of Parks and Recreation, re: changes in term for Devon-Aire Ice Arena from five (5) years to five (5), one (1) year agreements and increase in base ice rate for 2021-2022 ice season, with annual increases thereafter. (CR 376-15)

Ted Davis, Superintendent of Parks and Recreation, presented this request to Council. He stated we are looking for an updated lease agreement with Livonia Civic Arenas for the Devon-Aire Ice Arena. What we've seen over the past several years is a steady decrease in Livonia Hockey Association and overall ice skating teams which is putting Devon-Aire in a more and more tenuous situation regarding its continued operation. We want to work with LCA, they've been our partner for a long time here, they do a great job, and what they've asked of us is simply take a five-year lease extension and give them five one-year options, which we are happy to do. We want them to continue to be successful, we want them to continue operating Devon-Aire Ice Arena and this is a way for us to continue that partnership as long as we possibly can. The ice increase on the base rate is merely a formality and it's contractual. If they would have renewed their lease with us for the five years, that would have been the ice rate for the 2021/2022 season of \$217.00 per hour. So, there's no real increase. The language there, 4% or CPI, Consumer Price Index, whichever is greater, again, is language that was already in the existing agreement and the previous agreement. I'd be happy to answer any questions Council may have on this.

Councilmember McCullough said I remember skating at Devon-Aire for the past probably thirty-five years and it's a great arena, right at West Chicago and Merriman area, I played high school hockey there. Moving on to the Livonia Civic Arenas, especially to touch base, the hockey has been declining but it's funny, I'm looking at my six-year old who we're signing up for the Livonia Knights 8U that is growing. So, there is some hope out there. A lot of times these arenas have those very costly evaporating cooling towers and ice is not easy to maintain, it costs money and there's a lot of energy that goes into it. The Livonia Civic Arenas, they put up with me personally throughout the adult hockey years, so for that alone I support them. But on top of that, too, \$217.00 in the perspective of hockey arenas, I mean some of our neighboring communities are upwards of \$350.00 an hour. So, they operate a great game, love to have them, and I'm hoping, too, fingers crossed, that we get hockey growing again. So, if there's no objection, I'd be happy to offer an approving for Consent.

Councilmember Donovic asked Davis just out of curiosity, have you spoken about a plan that they have for the future to try to get more hockey players into the doors to make more money?

Davis replied that's a great question. One of the things, they can only do so much, I mean they're trying to do more on the adult end of it. Livonia Hockey Association usually oversees and runs the youth programs in offering. LCA also does offer learn to skate and figure skating programs through Eddie Edgar and Devon-Aire. So, they're definitely attempting additional programming in offering new things. One meeting I do have coming up is with the President of Livonia Hockey Association, to try to see where we can partner and grow the sport. You know I think obviously the more kids we get playing, you know at Stevenson and all these teams usually do extremely well at the high school level, we want to see that continue and we just simply need to introduce as many kids as possible to this sport, that we want to maintain three sheets of ice in two ice arenas.

Councilmember Donovic said thanks, Mr. Davis, you bring up good points. I mean hockey is an awesome sport and I know a lot of kids that I grew up with, I played hockey, not competitively, just for fun, but it's a really big sport and I'd hate to see an arena on the southern side of town have to close down because a lack of business, they just can't afford the bills, so hopefully we can do anything we possibly can to keep them running.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White

(Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

6) REQUEST TO APPROVE PURCHASE AND INSTALLATION OF A PAVILION THROUGH THE SOURCEWELL PURCHASING PROGRAM: Department of Parks and Recreation, re: to replace the existing pavilion at Clements Circle Park, from budgeted funds.

Ted Davis, Superintendent of Parks and Recreation, presented this request to Council. He said we are asking for replacement of a pavilion at Clements Circle Park. The current one is a 24 by 24 with a shingled roof, we're asking for a replacement. This is one of our last shingled roof shelters we have in the system. This project was previously approved by Council in an IGA with Wayne County, part of this is going to be reimbursable through our Wayne County Parks Funds Grant. I'd be happy to answer any questions Council may have on this project.

Councilmember McCullough said I'd like to commend Mr. Davis and the team for focusing on Clements Circle Park. I know, if I'm right, hasn't there been a lot of new developments that we've had, whether it's the walking path, the pool obviously, the splash pad, the new playground and that's all been within the last five to ten years.

Davis replied that definitely has been within the last six years since I've been here, so, with the pool, we've done playground replacement there and obviously the pool was a large capital expenditure, the playground was certainly a nice addition. We have, moving forward, some path repair going on there and then obviously we think that with the development approved at the former middle school site there that we'll have some additional parking as well. I think we've really addressed Clements Circle on the south end very, very well, and I think this will be one of the, knock on wood, one of the last projects we undertake there for a period of time for sure.

McCullough said thank you and well done, I'm sure that the Clements Circle Association thanks you as well. If there's no objections, I'd offer an approving for Consent.

Councilmember Donovic said hats off to Ted Davis and your department for the focus you do on all the parks but it's awesome to see Clements Circle getting these upgrades. I was going to ask a question about the pavilion, I couldn't find it in the packet earlier but I did find it, if there was going to be any seating built into the pavilion. Looking at the renderings it doesn't look like there will be any kind of seating, am I correct?

Davis replied that's correct. We tend to not put in fixed seating in these. Most groups want the picnic tables they can move around and we can easily replace as wear and tear dictates, so no fixed seating in these.

Donovic asked does this seem like the new direction that you are going with pavilions and more like a metal style roof as opposed to the traditional shingled roof, and are you seeing longer longevity out of the life of those roofs?

Davis replied yes, I think that's the direction we've gone for about the past fifteen years and what we've seen is the anti-graffiti makes it a little more difficult to mark up and a little easier to clean up if it is. Also, aside from a major branch or something hitting it, a metal roof will basically last I don't want to say quite forever but I'll be long gone by the time it needs to be replaced. So, with a shingled roof or an asphalt roof, there's obviously more wear and tear potential and replacement needs that would go on. So, we believe these metal roofs have been a good investment for us. I mean we're not going around and replacing them or repainting them. They have held up very well. So, unless something falls on it significant, it's pretty much maintenance free.

Donovic said last question, since we are building it new, is power going to be provided to the pavilion for people to plug in stuff?

Davis replied no, we have no plans to put power out there. We typically only do that in our staff areas. So, really the only pavilion that has power is going to be Rotary Park and really that's Pavilion 1 at Rotary Park. Mies actually does have power nearby. Stymelski does have power nearby. So, there are the odd ones that do have power boxes nearby but for the most part we do not.

Councilmember Toy asked Davis if there are any plans with the new development that's going to be right in that area, is there anything that perhaps the developer can help us with as well? I know that Wayne County and I'm sure Commissioner Marecki helped us out, and the other commissioner and his name is failing me, he just got appointed, David Knezek, I think that's part of his district as well. The commissioners have been so generous for us, you know, getting those dollars, and you've done a miraculous job and your team you know over the many years that I've sat here. You know really paid attention to the south end, particularly that area, it's just been miraculous. And that's why we'll have to look at if there's some other needs down there, perhaps we can get those met by a few others, too. Just a suggestion as we move forward.

Davis said we are always hoping to utilize other resources and all resources available to us including obviously our County Commissioners and any private contractors or citizens that would help us along the way. We are hopeful that that parking lot expansion which is being done as a part of that new development immediately to the south is a significant improvement for that site and certainly people on Harrison are going to notice the difference there every day during the summer when there aren't cars parked up and down the street. So, you know, we're constantly looking for improvements and we think that's a great partnership we have with Soave and Infinity Homes.

Toy said not that I need numbers, and I guess I don't need reassurance, but just for our viewing audience and others, that park is well – not only maintained but it's well received as well as the pool. Anytime I've been down that way, it's been packed, especially in the summer. Is that true, Mr. Davis, that it's pretty well used, not year round obviously but it's one of our parks that is very popular, correct?

Davis replied I would agree. I would say from a neighborhood park that Clements Circle is a neighborhood park, in that class. Where a Ford, Sheldon, Bicentennial, Rotary, are community parks just because of how large they are and their location off of major thoroughfares. I would say Clements Circle is our most popular neighborhood park.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

7) REQUEST TO AUTHORIZE APPROPRIATION AND EXPENDITURE: Department of Public Works, re: to enable payment to Lakeshore Global Corporation (LGC) for the emergency Pressure Reducing Valve (PRV-4) replacement at 8 Mile and Newburgh Roads, in conjunction with Great Lakes Water Authority (GLWA) wholesale meter replacement, from the Unexpended Fund Balance.

Jacob Rushlow, Superintendent of Public Works, presented this request to Council. He said as you recall a few months back we had come before you to discuss this planned project with the Great Lakes Water Authority, working in conjunction with them to replace one of our wholesale water meters located near the intersection of Eight Mile and Newburgh Road. This project required a shutdown of that meter connection which is the City's single largest water source from the GLWA System. That project was planned to take about two weeks to complete. There were two contractors involved, D'Angelo Brothers was working on the City's side of the component in that water meter vault. And Lakeshore Global was working on behalf of Great Lakes Water Authority on their side of the system. After the shutdown was initiated and D'Angelo Brothers commenced beginning the demolition portion of the City's system, we had an issue that arose at our secondary feed which was back feeding this area of the City's water system at Eight Mile and Haggerty Road, about one mile to the west of this project location. When this happened the Water Division had to perform manual operations to control the water system and flows and pressures on a rotating 24-hour schedule in that northwest portion of the City. So to expedite the project completion and try to limit the extent of variable water pressures throughout the City, we authorized GLWA's contractor, Lakeshore Global, to engage in completing our portion on the City's side of the PRV work, to get that done as soon as possible. This enabled the project to be completed in one week instead of two, and the City's water system was able to be returned to normal operations in half the time that was expected. So, with that explanation, the department is requesting Council to authorize payment in the amount of \$19,646.19 to Lakeshore Global Corporation for completion of the PRV installation work.

Councilmember Toy offered an approving resolution for the Consent Agenda.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

8) REQUEST TO ADJUST WATER AND SEWER CONSUMPTION RATES, INDUSTRIAL SURCHARGE RATE AND INDUSTRIAL WASTE CONTROL CHARGE: Public Service Division, re: to become effective on July 1, 2021.

Jacob Rushlow, Superintendent of Public Works, presented this request to Council. He said Connie Kumpula from the Finance Department is with him on this request and said she will speak at the beginning.

Connie Kumpula, Chief Accountant, stated they are here to talk about the proposed water and sewer rates. This rate is built with a collaborative effort between DPW and Finance and when we look at this rate, our goal to build it is revenue neutral which also means we're here just to basically cover our costs. And so if revenue neutral isn't our goal then we need to understand what the costs for the upcoming rate year. We know that our wholesalers, Great Lakes Water Authority, where we buy our water in Wayne County for sewage treatment constitutes most of the costs that we need to cover with this rate. And so to that extent if they increase their rates, we in turn need to increase ours. And GLWA did pass-through to us a small increase this year, about 2% for both the current unit and the monthly charge. Wayne County has yet to send us our rates but we can't wait for them so we did build an increase into this rate as well from them using an estimate of about 3%. So, once you look at all the costs that this rate has to cover, then you have to look at to see how are we going to recover those costs. And one of the things that we look at is our quarterly fixed fee, we've been charging it for a couple of years now and when we looked at that we decided for that fixed fee, quarterly fee, we were not going to change that. It's 69.75 per quarter for now with some union dues, but we didn't feel that that needed to be increased in order to cover our costs. But what did increase this year was our proposed water and sewer variable rate which saw a slight increase and we had to do that again to accomplish our revenue neutral goal. And that rate increase is mainly due to our pass-through charges from our wholesale providers. The low volume users saw a 1.13% increase, the average volume user is 1.58% increase and the high volume user was 1.82%. Dollar wise for the average volume user, this translates to about \$2.80 per quarter. One thing I did not talk about was the Livonia costs, we have infrastructure, maintenance, administrative costs, all of these things also impact the water and sewer rates but the Livonia costs only comprises about 31% of the total costs that we need to cover. So I'm going to let Jacob talk about the City's costs and their impact on the water and sewer rate. And I just want to leave you with again that our proposed water and sewer rates reflect the costs of providing water service to our Livonia residents and is set as revenue neutral. Overall Livonia users still pay much less for water services than users in most surrounding communities. And at the end I'll be happy to answer any questions or dive into any details that you want about this year's rate proposal.

President McIntyre thanked Kumpula for her excellent review.

Vice President Bahr said I agree, that was a really good explanation, thank you. I do have a number of questions. There's a place in the documents that were provided to

us it's under a review of the water and sewer fund performance for Fiscal Year 2020, I just need help understanding this. It says the water and sewer fund experienced a net operating gain of 1.8 million last year. But then it says later in the paragraph it says operating revenue was down and operating expenses were up, I think I just answered my question, never mind. When I read that earlier it wasn't making sense but it's making sense to me now as I read the details of that. The next question I had there's a comment also in there about the administration is exploring ways to provide customer billing and collection services at reduced costs; is there anything that you're prepared to talk about, what that is tonight?

Kumpula replied I am not.

Rushlow replied the one thing that we always have been working out over the last oh probably six or seven years or so now is an implementation of our remote read system for water meters which really streamlines some of the billing process, increases accuracy of our meter reading and the frequency of our meter reading, so that's one big improvement that we've been working on to help with that aspect. Our Smart meter change outs at this time last year we were at about 45% of the City was covered with that type of a system, we're now up to just over 64% of all water customers have a remote Smart Read System on their home transmit that signal to us remotely, so that's one example.

Bahr said another question I have is the comparison of us to surrounding cities, I know in most years we've been delighted to talk about how we have the lowest rates and the lowest rate of increase of the surrounding communities. That's not the case this year. We're still at the lower end but Farmington Hills and Canton, at least those with the sump pump, actually show lower than us. But I'm curious, have they addressed their rates yet this year, are the rates that we're seeing here their latest or do we anticipate theirs going up as well?

Kumpula replied I know that none of the communities have set their rates yet. I believe Canton, I think they just renegotiated their contract on the sewer side and I can't remember, I don't have it with me, I should have brought it with me but I think they just renegotiated their sewer contract which is why and it's not with Wayne County which is why their rates dropped significantly.

Bahr said which maybe is a nice segue to my next question, which is I know there's been talk, and this isn't so much related to the rates tonight but just long term, there's been talk about maybe forming a separate authority that Livonia would be part of, there's been talk about a water tower, any new news on those items?

Rushlow said I can answer that. I think that they're looking at that list, too, Councilman Bahr, and compare it to those other communities. Two things that we did see recently over the last few years, it's been a few years now, Farmington Hills had installed their water tower that you can see from I-275 and that enabled them to renegotiate a contract with GLWA as a max day customer where they're able to use that storage volume of water in that tank to shave their peak high demands in maximum demand periods, so

they're shaving that peak off and staying at a maximum sustained level of flow which reduces their costs and the cost of delivery of water to them during peak demands. Canton Township, very similar scenario, they just did that a few years ago with a large ground storage reservoir, they've optimized that system and they're now fully functional as essentially a max day customer, similar to Farmington Hills. And what Connie had alluded to with the change on their sewer side because they're a part of the Western Township Utility Authority for sewer service which had the ability to switch between sending sewage to Wayne County or they could send it to the Ypsilanti Community Utility Authority System and their Wastewater Treatment Plant down in Ypsilanti. So, they had renegotiated contracts as well with YCUA and are now, the entire Western Township Utility Authority is sending all of their sewage flow to the YCUA system instead at a greatly reduced rate to what they were paying here through Wayne County. So, they were able to see that cost benefit as well which helped to lower their costs.

Bahr asked are we continuing to look at the water tower option for ourselves?

Rushlow replied yes, we absolutely are still looking at that scenario and what it would look like for us, to us as a city to implement potentially a water storage reservoir of some kind. We had engaged our engineers to open up the study that was done back in 2016 using current demand scenarios, costs, all those good things and kind of update that study. We'll have that and be able to share that with everyone shortly.

Bahr said one final question, back on the rate comparison question, refresh my memory; were we the lowest last year, prior to this change?

Rushlow replied we were second lowest.

Bahr said I just want to make sure I've got my ducks in a row and I had questions about it and I'm studying accurate facts, so I appreciate your clear explanations of things and all your work on this, thank you.

Councilmember Donovic said if you don't mind my asking, Mr. Rushlow, maybe you already said so, but maybe I missed it, why is the City of Canton able to have a lower cost than we are?

Rushlow replied there's really those two main factors, one, they recently installed a water storage reservoir to help them maintain a maximum day flow as a customer instead of a peak demand flow, peak hour scenario, so they can shave that off their demand curve. And the other is the change to that, what I mentioned, the Western Township Utility Authority sewage rate, when they send that flow out to Ypsilanti instead of the GLWA's previous rate from what they're paying, well, Livonia is paying through the Wayne County system.

Councilmember Toy said I don't have my back-up information up on the screen, can you help me out, when is the last time we didn't have a rate increase for the City of Livonia; is it in recent memory?

Kumpula asked if Toy is talking about the flat rate?

Toy replied any kind of rate increase, have we always had a rate increase over the last how many years? I don't remember except when we went after them in the Senate, they did not go after Livonia and they didn't give us a rate increase, which would have been back in 2004. If you have any kind of background on that or if we could get a table on those, if I may.

I'm actually doing the residential water rate history, this will go back to 2012, and we have had a rate increase almost every year but our rate increase over the last five years has been less than 3% combined. So, while we have had our rates increased every year, we have maintained a relatively low rate increase.

Toy said so that's been since 2012 for your records that we've had rate increases every year.

Kumpula replied yes, except for this low usage user year one to two, we had a decrease from twelve to thirteen, but every year after that there's been an increase. But like I said, we still maintain for all user types, for the last five years it's been less than 3% overall.

Toy said and we also have an administrative fee tacked on to those water bills as well that other cities doesn't really have as well. And I don't know how many, I didn't take an inventory of that, but just wondered. I'm sure there will be an approving on this, Madam Chair, but I'd certainly like it on the Regular.

Bahr said I just wanted to make sure I heard that right, you said over the last five years there's been a cumulative increase of what percent?

Kumpula replied combined across all user types it's been less than 3% on average.

Bahr said less than 3% total over the last five years.

McIntyre replied no, no, average.

Kumpula said average, not total.

Bahr asked less than 3% per year?

Kumpula replied on average over the last five years.

Bahr said that's an annual increase, that's not a total increase for the five years and Kumpula replied correct.

President McIntyre said I have a question. Connie, in all of the years that we've had, have we ever had an increase in the rate when we did not as the payor, as the paying

customer of GLWA, did we ever raise rates on the people that we sell the water to when we did not incur increased rates?

Kumpula replied I don't have enough history for GLWA, personal history, on my part for setting the rates to remember if we had a year where we didn't have a GLWA and we didn't also increase the residents rates, am I saying this right? I don't know the year where we had no increase from GLWA but then we also increased a rate to the Livonia residents, I don't know of a year like that.

McIntyre said before the next meeting can we just double check that? I can't think of a year that I'm aware of, and I don't go back as far some of the other Council members do, but I've paid attention to water rates for a long time, a year when we gave our residents an increase, again, for water that we're essentially reselling to them, when we didn't have an increase that we pay as the first line customer, if you will.

Vice President Bahr offered an approving resolution stating it's important to remember with these things, with this being just a revenue neutral approach that the actions that contribute to these things are all the things that get approved throughout the course of the year. So when we get to this point, there's really not – I mean it's good to ask these questions, understand, but there's not much purpose in not approving these. The result of not approving these would be a deficit in the budget. The actions that lead to this are complete. So, to me, we need to continue to ask these questions and continue to understand it, but there's no responsible thing to do here other than to approve this. I'll offer an approving.

President McIntyre said the other choice would be I believe that we would have the option if there's money in the Unexpended Fund Balance to cover a deficit but then to start doing that it affects our bond rating adversely and then the City ends up paying more interest rates every time we have to borrow money.

Vice President Bahr said Madam President, sorry to jump in again, but not to mention that we've already seen on at least two occasions tonight projects that have required us to go into that Unexpended Fund Balance.

Councilmember Toy said my point was as well that we've always had rate increases. It wasn't since, if you go back in history, probably about 2004 or whatever, right in that neighborhood, that they didn't get a rate increase. That's when Kwame was there and Ferguson playing their games and tactics. So, I mean this has a long history and forever we had rate increases, whether it's residential, commercial, sewage, whatever you want to say. There's always been a little bit of a rate increase and if you scan that over, it is an increase, and it's an increase to our residents and others. So, while I get it, we're being held hostage, I mean that's where we get our water from. Others have gone to other systems, which ours is good, don't get me wrong, Detroit water is clean, it's great, all that. But some of these systems sometimes are that you're paying for it. And I think our City people that represent us do a darn good job down there, it's just I wish we could arm wrestle a little bit, too. I know 3% doesn't sound like a lot, but I'd just like to come to a Council meeting one year and we don't have an increase, that's all.

Don Rohraff, Director of Public Works, said I just wanted to confirm what Councilmember Toy said. Yes, since my existence here we've had increases only when we've had increases from whether it be DWSD and/or GLWA.

President McIntyre said she was the one that asked that question.

Rohraff apologized and said to that point, we have done a long, long history of the water rates in regard to and the fees and the way that we were being charged at the time and I think it was maybe Councilperson Toy that had brought up the admin fee or the fixed rate. And that's because the way that we were being charged rates was the way that we needed to turn around and charge our citizens and our residents and our businesses that way as well. But I'm pretty sure that that hasn't increased in a really long time. We've worked really hard to keep that fixed fee constant because that really does affect the single homeowner and the light users in that respect. So we worked really hard to keep that down and again, I know this is pounding on a drum that's been beaten a few times tonight, but we really are working hard just to keep that revenue neutral. But I just wanted to confirm that, I know Connie said that her history with the rates and that portion of this revenue is fine, mine is probably double hers but that's where we're at, I just wanted to throw my two cents in there, thank you.

Vice President Bahr said I just think it's evidence of the hard work done by our Administration to keep these low when we read that the increase from GLWA was at 1.92% wholesale per unit increase, they're fixed fee went up 2.07%, so both those around 2%; Livonia's average rate increase is 1.58%, less than what we're getting from GLWA. Without seeing all of the details and the numbers, that is evidence to me of some hard work being done to keep our rates as low as possible. So I just want to point that out.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

REGULAR

**CITY OF LIVONIA – CITY COUNCIL
MINUTES OF STUDY MEETING HELD MAY 24, 2021**

Meeting was called to order via Zoom remote technology at 8:23 p.m. by President Kathleen McIntyre. Present: Scott Bahr (Livonia, Michigan); Cathy White (Livonia, Michigan); Brandon McCullough (Livonia, Michigan); Rob Donovic (Livonia, Michigan); Laura Toy (Livonia, Michigan); and President Kathleen McIntyre (Livonia, Michigan). Absent: Jim Jolly.

Vice President Scott Bahr led the meeting in the Pledge of Allegiance.

9) REQUEST TO RENEW LEASE AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF LIVONIA AND THE LIVONIA SAVE OUR YOUTH TASK FORCE: Department of Law, re: for a period of three (3) years beginning August 1, 2021 and expiring of July 31, 2024 (CR 295-18).

Vice President Bahr offered an approving resolution for the Consent Agenda.

Councilmember McCullough asked if Council has the ability to amend any of the items in the agreement, I assume we do. The only reason I bring this up is under 4-3 is the rental payment by tenant, with Covid and Livonia, Save Our Youth has been such an integral part of the community, I know this is small but it's showing we have a 3% rate increase and with the recent pandemic I'm wondering if we could eliminate that. It's not much but just keep it the \$403.15 a month.

City Attorney Bernier said I understand what Mr. McCullough is saying but the negotiating of the lease is a function of the Administration and not that of Council and Council's choice at this point would be to offer a denying or approving resolution on that. I do understand what you're saying, Councilmember McCullough.

McCullough replied it was one of those things that as I was going through the packet and like I said it's not a ton, for that matter I'll leave it the way it is and propose on the record the recommendation that for future leases, we look at that. So thank you.

DIRECTION:

APPROVING

CONSENT